

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 182 872

EA 012 517

AUTHOR Schumacher, Sally; Pennington, Jude
TITLE Impact of Title IX on Secondary Physical Education Curricula and Instruction: Toward a Public Policy Analysis.
PUB DATE Apr 80
NOTE 16p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (Boston, MA, April 1980)
EDRS PRICE MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS *Federal Legislation; Literature Reviews; *Physical Education; *Program Effectiveness; School Surveys; Secondary Education; Student Attitudes; Tables (Data); Teacher Attitudes
IDENTIFIERS Title IX Education Amendments 1972

ABSTRACT

This report contains public policy and programmatic outcomes resulting from the impact of Title IX on the physical education curricula and instruction in secondary public schools. Eighty-three percent of Virginia secondary physical education chairpersons completed a questionnaire by June, 1978, the year of compliance. Data were analyzed with descriptive statistics. Although compliance was achieved, public policy outcomes of positive staff/student attitudes toward sex-equity in a majority of physical education activities had differential results, and improved student skill development had limited results. (Author)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

ED182872

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH,
EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

IMPACT OF TITLE IX ON SECONDARY PHYSICAL
EDUCATION CURRICULA AND INSTRUCTION: TOWARD
A PUBLIC POLICY ANALYSIS

Sally Schumacher and Jude Pennington
Virginia Commonwealth University

A paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the
American Educational Research Association,
Boston, April, 1980.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY
HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

S. Schumacher
J. Pennington

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

EA 012 517

IMPACT OF TITLE IX ON SECONDARY PHYSICAL EDUCATION CURRICULA AND
INSTRUCTION: TOWARD A PUBLIC POLICY ANALYSIS

Sally Schumacher and Jude Pennington

The impact of Title IX on secondary physical education programs demonstrates the interrelationships of public policy and programmatic outcomes. Programmatic outcomes are relatively narrow and focus on process objectives for implementing a curriculum and on student achievement. Public policy outcomes are relatively broad goals which have implications for the nature of American society.

Berlak (1970) suggests several criteria for identifying public policy issues in an educational program. First, does the program immediately or in the future affect the status and power of an individual within a social system? To alter or to attempt to alter a student's status or power, physical or mental, resulting from participation in a curriculum, is to expand or narrow his/her freedom to choose alternatives, i.e., extra-curricular activities, life-long recreational interests, career choices. Second, does the program tend to increase or decrease political or social tensions within a school or ultimately within a community and a society? Legislative action which mandates an educational program may be less concerned with its curriculum impact and more concerned with responding to pressure groups. Third, does the program effect a change in a student's self-concept or sense of self-worth? For example, a program goal of sex-equity¹ instruction may be achieved, but do some students now feel less worthy because their accomplishments no longer receive recognition and thus student motivation declines? These criteria seem to imply that all educational programs have public policy issues. Given the nature of the American political system and the structure of educational

government (Scribner, 1977, Iannaccone and Lutz, 1970), most educational policies and programs do contain latent public policy issues:

This paper analyzes the impact of Title IX on Virginia secondary physical education curricula and instruction. Previous studies of Title IX implementation have focused on educational change and school athletics (Stieger, 1978, Selby, 1979). The programmatic impact of Title IX is analyzed in terms of intended outcomes, anticipated but unintended outcomes, and unanticipated and unintended outcomes. These outcomes are then related to possible public policy goals.

Passage of Title IX and Compliance Regulations

Physical education was not the initial impetus for the passage of Title IX of the Educational Amendments Act of 1972. Perhaps as much as 40 to 50 percent of the attention was centered on vocational education which proponents of Title IX viewed as a curriculum area which was sex-segregated and fostered sex-stereotyping. Testimony on the bill in the first session of Congress contained few references to physical education or athletics and, although there were over 600 pages of testimony on the bill in the second session, most of this testimony, again, did not focus on physical education. Senator Birch Bayh who introduced the bill in the Senate was reported to have said, "obviously this regulation will pose some impact on athletic programs." However, few policy-makers or educators envisioned that physical education and athletics would become the major focal points after the passage of the bill (Blaufaub, 1978).

Title IX of the Educational Amendments Act of 1972 provided that:

No person . . . shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits, or be subjected to

discrimination under an educational program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance. (Department of Health, Education and Welfare, 1976, p. 6.)

Riley (1976) suggested that the Title IX Amendment was the first comprehensive anti-sex discrimination law extended to students and that "Title IX of these Amendments will eventually produce revolutionary changes in American education" (p. 8).

Proponents of sex-integrated instruction provided a philosophical basis for the application of the law in physical education. Physical education would no longer be one of the few instructional areas that provided sex-segregated activities. Elliot (1972) argued that the demands of modern society required sexes to learn to exercise and play together. Co-physical education activities could foster a healthy social growth through opportunities for boys and girls to develop respect for each other as individuals, acquire skills in social conduct, and build a foundation for a lifetime of maximum participation. Previous research tended to support the social benefits of coeducational instruction as perceived by students (McCann, 1954) and physical education staff (Kozman, Cassidy and Jackson, 1967).

Few proponents focused on the possible effect of sex-equity on physical skill development of students. According to Elliot (1972), empirical research did not support physiological reasons for sex-differentiated physical education programs. Previous research comparing the effects of sex-integrated instruction and sex-segregated instruction on performance appeared inconclusive. Research comparing skill acquisition in badminton, volleyball, and archery between college coeducational and segregated classes indicated no significant difference (Evaul, 1961; Tallman, 1970) but demonstrated a significant difference in tennis (Brightwell, 1969). Farrelly (1976) found in sixth graders that high

ability females performed significantly better on a simple motor task when alone or with other females than under heterosexual conditions. High ability males performed significantly higher in the presence of others, either male or female, than when alone.

Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 did not go into immediate effect. The Department of Health, Education and Welfare solicited public comments until 1974 and issued regulations implementing Title IX in 1975. The regulations mandated in institutional self-evaluation of all policies and practices and full compliance to federal policies by July 21, 1978 (H.E.W., 1976).

The most specific requirements for nondiscrimination in physical education programs were delineated in Section 86.34 on access to course offerings and Section 86.33 on comparable facilities. A school was prohibited from providing a course or separate activity solely on the basis of sex or requiring or refusing participation of its students solely on the basis of sex. Students could be separated within physical education classes during participation in "wrestling, boxing, rugby, ice hockey, football, basketball or other sports (where) the purpose or major activity ... involves bodily contact" (H.E.W., 1976, p. 3). Further, the use of a single standard for measuring skills should not have an adverse effect on the members of one sex. Schools could provide separate toilet, locker room and shower facilities on the basis of sex, but these facilities should be comparable for both sexes.

The guidelines for applying these regulations delegated discretionary power to schools in how compliance was achieved. Title IX did not require any specific physical education curricula or activities, but it did require those that were offered to be open equally to students of both sexes. Any participation requirements must be the same for boys and girls. Physical

education classes may not be conducted separately for boys and girls unless they dealt exclusively with human sexuality or resulted in bodily contact. Schools providing sex-segregated instruction in contact sports had to provide comparable instruction to both sexes. The physical education staff could not be treated differentially on the basis of sex in job assignments or teaching and supervisory duties other than locker room supervision. Physical education facilities and equipment must be allocated without regard to the sex of students or instructor (H.E.W., 1976, pp. 5-6).

Method

A survey was taken of all secondary physical education chairpersons (499) two months before the compliance date. Eighty-three percent of the population (414) completed a twenty-four item questionnaire in May, 1978, regarding their perceptions of how the implementation of Title IX affected the curricula and instructional practices. The questionnaire assessed the status, coeducational or sex-segregated, of 31 physical education activities in the current Virginia Physical Education Curriculum Guide (1968). The impact of Title IX implementation on 10 selected instructional aspects was determined. Finally, chairpersons were asked to report their perceptions of the attitudes of the physical education staff and students toward coeducational classes and the perceived effects of coeducational instruction on student skill development.

The 414 respondents were considered representative of the 133 school division of the state. Only 14 school divisions did not participate. In addition, the respondents were representative of school size, school level, and staff size. Forty-nine percent of the schools had male chairpersons; forty-two percent of the schools had female chairpersons; and nine percent of the schools had both male and female co-chairpersons.

The data was analyzed by frequency distribution and cross-tabulations for school size and school level, yielding percentages. All statistics were rounded to the nearest tenth. Because the cross-tabulation analysis did not indicate any major differences by school size or school level, the data presented here will be for the total group.

Results and Discussion

The analysis of the respondents' perceptions of the impact of Title IX on (1) the physical education curricula, (2) selected instructional practices, (3) staff and student attitudes toward coeducation classes, and (4) student skill development is presented in five Tables². The results are further analyzed in terms of intended programmatic outcomes, anticipated but unintended outcomes, and unanticipated and unintended outcomes.

Insert Table 1 about here

The impact of Title IX on the physical education curricula was as intended, i.e., compliance by decreasing the frequency of sex-differentiated instruction. In those activities which 50% or more of the schools taught, a majority of the activities in the categories of team sports, individual and dual sports, gymnastics, and conditioning exercises increased from 30% to 61% in frequency of coeducational instruction. The only exception was in the category of rhythms.

For example, the frequency of coeducational instruction in team sports increased 61% in volleyball (from 21% to 82%), 58% in softball (from 16% to 74%), 55% in basketball (from 10% to 65%), 41% in soccer (from 10% to 51%), 32% in flag football (from six percent to 38%), 18% in field hockey (from four percent to 22%), and 14% in touch football (from three percent to 17%).

Table 1

Status and Impact of Title IX on
Physical Education Curricula

Activity	Status		Impact		
	% Schools Taught	% Coed 1975	% Coed 1978	% Dropped	% Added
<u>Team Sports</u>					
Basketball	99	10	65	0	0
Fieldball	9	1	5	1	0
Field Hockey	61	4	22	4	1
Flag Football	75	6	33	3	1
Soccer	83	10	51	0	1
Softball	95	16	74	0	1
Speed-A-Way	10	1	7	0	0
Speedball	44	5	25	2	0
Touch Football	54	3	17	.7	1
Volleyball	99	21	82	0	1
Other	13	2	9	0	1
<u>Rhythms</u>					
Ballet	3	1	1	1	0
Modern Dance	37	4	10	6	1
Social Dance	21	11	13	1	2
Square Dance	49	21	34	2	2
Other	14	4	8	2	0
<u>Individual and Dual</u>					
Aerial Tennis	5	1	4	0	0
Archery	53	14	42	1	1
Badminton	69	18	55	0	1
Bowling	43	12	31	0	1
Deck Tennis	14	3	11	0	0
Golf	41	11	33	1	0
Handball (wall)	16	4	12	1	0
Horseshoes	42	11	31	0	1
Paddle Tennis	21	5	16	0	0
Shuffleboard	43	11	35	1	1
Table Tennis	71	22	59	0	1
Tennis	71	17	55	0	1
Tetherball	4	1	3	0	0
Track and Field	85	18	68	0	0
Wrestling	70	2	12	6	0
Other	6	2	5	0	0
<u>Gymnastics</u>					
Apparatus	69	11	44	1	1
Body Mechanics	29	3	16	1	0
Stunts	68	11	47	1	0
Tumbling	92	16	65	1	0
Pyramids	40	6	27	1	0
Weight Training	41	4	24	0	0
Other	10	2	5	0	0
<u>Conditioning Exercises</u>					
Calisthenics	88	13	64	0	1
Other	6	1	41	3	0

The frequency of coeducational instruction in individual and dual sports increased 50% in track and field (from 18% to 68%), 38% in tennis (from 17% to 55%), 37% in table tennis (from 22% to 59%), 37% in badminton (from 18% to 55%), 28% in archery (from 14% to 42%), and 10% in wrestling (from two percent to 12%). The frequency of coeducational instruction in gymnastics increased 49% in tumbling (from 16% to 65%), 35% in stunts (from 11% to 47%), and 33% in apparatus (from 11% to 44%). The frequency of coeducational instruction increased 51% in calisthenics (from 13% to 64%). Although rhythms activities were taught by fewer schools, the frequency of coeducational instruction increased 13% in square dance (from 21% to 34%), and six percent in modern dance (from four percent to 10%).

The activities which had over 50% of their instruction now provided on a coeducational basis were: volleyball (82%), softball (74%), track and field (68%), basketball (65%), tumbling (65%), calisthenics (64%), table tennis (59%), tennis (55%), badminton (55%), and soccer (51%).

The impact of Title IX on the physical education curricula appeared to be one of increased frequency of coeducational instruction rather than one of dropping or adding an activity. No more than two percent of the schools added an activity to their curriculum and with few exceptions, no more than three percent dropped an activity. The exceptions were: seven percent of the schools dropped touch football, six percent of the schools dropped modern dance and wrestling, and four percent of the schools dropped field hockey.

Table 2
Changes in Selected Aspects of
Instruction as a Result of Title IX

Aspects of Instruction	Improved %	Remained the Same %	Declined %
Relationship between Male/Female Physical Education Staff	39	56	5
Instructional Approach of Male Staff	35	57	8
Instructional Approach of Female Staff	29	63	8
Teaching Conditions	20	53	27
Grading Procedures	21	63	17
Participation by Boys	35	51	14
Participation by Girls	38	41	21
Rules Modification	33	59	8
Use of Facilities	29	59	12
Managing Discipline Problems	23	50	26

The impact of Title IX on selected aspects of physical education instruction, by the year of compliance, suggests anticipated, intended and unintended outcomes. Respondents perceived that 38% of the girls and 35% of the boys improved in their participation. Respondents also reported that male/female staff relationships, instructional approaches, grading procedures, and facility use had remained the same or improved. These programmatic outcomes seemed intended.

However, two aspects of instruction were reported by the respondents as declining more than improving. While teaching conditions and managing discipline problems remained the same in 50% or more of the schools, there was also a decline by 26% in managing discipline and by 27% in teaching conditions. These outcomes seem to be unintended.

Table 3
Staff Attitudes Toward Coeducational
Physical Education Classes

Staff Attitudes	Chairperson %	Staff %	Total %
All or Majority of Instruction on a Coed Basis	36	29	33
All or Majority of Instruction on a Separate Basis	25	30	26
Some Instruction on a Coed Basis	37	37	37
Other	3	4	3

Staff and student attitudes toward coeducational classes appears to be unanticipated and unintended outcomes of the Title IX mandate. Chairpersons were asked to indicate their feelings and the perceptions of Physical Education staff members toward coeducational physical education. Thirty-seven percent of the total staff felt only some physical education instruction should be on a coeducational basis. While 33% of the staff felt all or a majority of instruction should be on a coeducational basis, 26% of the staff felt all or a majority of instruction should be on a separate basis.

Table 4
Perceptions of Student Attitudes Toward
Coeducational Physical Education Classes

Student Attitudes	Percent
Prefer Coed Physical Education Classes	27
Prefer Separate Physical Education Classes	41
Indifferent to either Organizational Structure	21
Other	11

The respondents reported that 41% of the students preferred sex-segregated classes; 27% preferred coeducational classes; and 21% were indifferent to either organizational pattern.

Table 5
Perceptions of Coeducational Physical
Education on Student Skill Development

Perceptions of Student Feelings	Boys %	Girls %	Total %
Feel Limited by Presence of Opposite Sex	59	41	50
Feel Indifferent	21	16	19
Feel Helped by Presence of Opposite Sex	10	30	20
Other	9	13	11

A second programmatic outcome which appears both unanticipated and unintended was the effect on student skill development. Respondents reported their perceptions of how students viewed the effect of coeducational classes on skill development. Fifty percent of the students felt limited in skill development by the presence of the opposite sex, but 20% of the students felt helped by the presence of the opposite sex. The presence of the opposite sex had differential effects on boys and girls. Forty-one percent of the girls and 59% of the boys felt limited in skill development in coeducational activities. However, 30% of the girls in contrast to 10% of the boys felt helped in skill development by coeducational activities.

Conclusions

Based on this study, the impact of Title IX on one state resulted in compliance by decreasing the frequency of sex-differentiated instruction in physical education activities. The response by the schools was to increase the number of coeducational activities in the existing curricula rather than drop or add new activities. In addition, there was improved participation by both boys and girls in physical education activities.

Compliance to public policy also brought anticipated intended and unintended programmatic outcomes in instructional-related areas. Male/female relationships, instructional approaches, grading procedures, and facility use either remained the same or improved. However, teaching conditions and managing discipline problems declined more than improved.

Compliance to public policy resulted in unanticipated and unintended programmatic outcomes in attitudes toward coeducational instruction and perceptions of opportunity for skill development. Staff attitudes toward sex-integrated instruction varied. While 37% of the physical education teachers felt only some of the activities should be sex-integrated, 32% felt a majority of the activities should be sex-integrated and 26% felt a majority of the activities should be sex-integrated. Forty-one percent of the students preferred sex-segregated classes in contrast to 27% who preferred sex-integrated classes. Further, 50% of the students felt limited in skill development by the presence of the opposite sex.

These outcomes raise the question of which was achieved by compliance: programmatic objectives or public policy goals? More specifically, what was the intent of public policy? If the intent of public policy was to decrease the frequency of sex-differentiated instruction and increase participation in physical educational activities by boys and girls, this study suggests public policy was achieved. If the intent of the public policy was also to foster positive sex-integration attitudes and social values resulting from co-physical activities, this study suggests differential results. If the intent of the public policy was to increase skill development, a traditional educational priority goal, public policy had limited results. It seems the primary programmatic objective of student achievement may be endangered by compliance to a public policy of sex-equity instruction. Further research is necessary to assess the impact of Title IX on student achievement.

Footnotes

1. Sex-equity refers to equal opportunity to participate in the physical education program. Sex-differentiated activities are those which are taught differently to students solely because of sex and no other factor such as skill development. Sex-differentiated is synonymous with sex-segregated or separate classes for boys and girls. Sex-integrated instruction refers to coeducational instruction.
2. All Tables were extrapolated from Tables 7-22 in Pennington, J. C. Impact of Title IX on the status of the physical education curricula of Virginia secondary public schools as perceived by department chairpersons (Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Florida State University, 1979).

References

- Berlak, H. Values, Goals, Public Policy and Educational Evaluation. Review of Education Research, 1970, 40, 261-278.
- Blaufarb, M. Complying with Title IX of the education amendments of 1972 in physical education and high school sports programs. Washington, D.C.: American Alliance for Health, Physical Education, and Recreation, 1976.
- Blaufarb, M. Director of Public Affairs. American Alliance for Health, Physical Education, and Recreation. Washington, D.C., Personal Communication, August 3, 1978.
- Brightwell, D. S. Effect of coeducational and segregated classes on tennis achievement. Research Quarterly, 1969, 40, 262-265.
- Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. Title IX and physical education: A compliance overview. Washington, D.C.: Office of Education, 1976.
- Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. Complying with Title IX: Implementing institutional self-evaluation. Washington, D.C.: Office of Education, 1977.
- Department of Health, Education, and Welfare. Education programs and activities receiving financial assistance: Nondiscrimination on the basis of sex. Washington, D.C.: Office of Education, 1974.
- Elliot, P.L. The beneficial outcomes of requiring coeducational programs. Journal of Health, Physical Education, and Recreation, 1972, 43(2), 35-36.
- Evaul, T. The effect of all male, all female, and coeducational classes on skill development in badminton. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Indiana University, 1961.

- Farrelly, J. F. The effects of coactors, sex of coactors, and ability level upon performance of a simple motor task. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Florida State University, 1976.
- Geadelmann, P. L. Student evaluation: Coeducational physical education. Unpublished study, Malcolm Price Laboratory School. Cedar Falls, Iowa, 1977.
- Iannaccone, L. and Lutz, F. W. Politics, power and policy: The governing of local school districts. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill, 1970.
- Kozman, H. C., Cassidy, R., and Jackson, C. O. Methods in physical education. Dubuque, Iowa: William C. Brown Co., 1967.
- McCann, J. A study of the factors affecting the values of coeducational physical education and corecreation in the public high schools of California. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1954.
- Pennington, J. Impact of Title IX on the status of the physical education curricula of Virginia secondary public schools as perceived by department chairpersons. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Florida State University, 1979.
- Riley, B. The effect of Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 on the administration of girls' competitive athletic programs in selected public high schools of Texas. 1976 (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 135 077).
- Scribner, J. D. (Ed.). The politics of education. Part II. The Seventy-sixth Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1977.
- Selby, R. Factors affecting educational innovation adaption: The Title IX mandate in secondary school physical education and athletics. A paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Association, San Francisco, California, April, 1979.
- Stieger, J. J. The effect of Title IX on the physical education programs in the public secondary schools in Florida. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Florida State University, 1978.
- Tallman, A. J. The effects of coeducational and segregated classes upon selected outcomes of college physical education courses. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, New York University, 1970.
- Virginia Department of Education. Physical education curriculum guide. Richmond, Va.: Department of Education, 1968.